

**World Economics Association  
Conferences, 2014**

**Is a more inclusive and sustainable development possible in Brazil?**

**2014, n. 1: 5th May – 20<sup>th</sup> July**

**Title of paper: The macroeconomic policy in a social-developmental strategy**

André Biancarelli and Pedro Rossi

**Abstract:**

Economic development, in any of the several possible definitions, is a medium- and long-term process. More than that, it is always a set of structural changes, which are not to be confused with the short term fluctuations in the macroeconomic variables that generally have more attention in the economic news: exchange rate, interest rates, inflation, unemployment, public deficit. Not even the rate of growth is a parameter, much less a synonym, of development. This, from the point of view of governmental actions, is defined more by issues such as the role of the Government in the economy, the set of industrial, regulation, infrastructure, financing and income distribution policies and other social action fronts, among many other policies. That is, it takes a lot more than a macroeconomic management (here understood as the handling of the monetary, exchange rate and fiscal policies) to characterize a development strategy, although there are several points of contact between the two dimensions. The former president Lula administration is a clear example of gradual and important changes in the development strategy that occurred despite the visible continuities in management of the macroeconomic regime.

Using an expression to the liking of economists, the macro regime is therefore a non-sufficient condition for development. But it seems to be a necessary condition, mainly because of the negative influences and barriers that it can impose on the conduct of procedures defined by the broader strategy. Again, the processes under way in the Brazilian economy over the past few years are a clear example of these restrictions.

Thus, the present paper deals with these relationships between the macroeconomic policy fronts themselves (exchange rate, monetary and fiscal) and an ideal development project, whose constituent elements were presented, in part, over the past presidential terms, but whose contents need to be revisited, deepened and complemented. This strategy, here called as "social-developmental", has its social component contextualized and summarized in the first section. On the second one, we present an overview of the constraints (mainly external) to the Brazilian growth model and to the operation of economic policy in the current context and the general directions that should guide it. The third section focuses on the institutional framework of each of these three policy fronts and assesses their recent conduct in Brazil, in the light of the preceding considerations. Brief conclusions finish the text.

**Keywords:** macroeconomic policy, development, Brazil

**Authors details:** Lecturers of the Institute of Economics, University of Campinas (Unicamp). [andremb@eco.unicamp.br](mailto:andremb@eco.unicamp.br); [pedrorossi@eco.unicamp.br](mailto:pedrorossi@eco.unicamp.br).



## **Introduction\***

According to any of the several possible definitions, economic development is a medium- and long-term process. More than that, it is always a set of structural changes, which are not to be confused with the short-term fluctuations in the macroeconomic variables that generally attract more attention in the economic news: exchange rate, interest rates, inflation, unemployment, public deficit. Not even the rate of growth is a parameter, much less a synonym, of development. From the perspective of governmental actions, this is defined more by issues such as the role of the government in the economy, the set of industrial, regulation, infrastructure, financing and income distribution policies and other social action fronts, among many other policies. That is, it takes much more than macroeconomic management (understood here as the handling of the monetary, exchange rate and fiscal policies) to characterize a development strategy, although there are several points of contact between the two dimensions. The former president Lula's administration is a clear example of gradual and important changes in the development strategy that occurred despite the visible continuities in the management of the macroeconomic regime.

Using an expression to the liking of economists, the macro regime is therefore a non-sufficient condition for development. However, it seems to be a necessary condition, mainly due to the negative influences and barriers that it can impose on the conduct of procedures defined by the broader strategy. Again, the processes under way in the Brazilian economy over the past few years reflect a clear example of these restrictions.

Thus, the present paper deals with these relationships between the macroeconomic policy fronts themselves (exchange rate, monetary and fiscal) and an ideal development project, whose constituent elements were presented, in part, over the past presidential terms, but whose contents need to be revisited, deepened and complemented. The social component of this strategy, here termed as "social-developmental", is contextualized and summarized in the first section.<sup>1</sup> In the second section, we present an overview of the constraints (mainly external) to the Brazilian growth model and the operation of economic policy in the current context, as well as the general directions that should guide it. The third section focuses on the institutional framework of each of these three policy fronts and assesses their recent conduct in Brazil, in the light of the preceding considerations. Finally, some brief conclusions finish the text.

## **1. Deepening and renewing the social emphasis of the Brazilian development**

---

\* Lecturers of the Institute of Economics, University of Campinas (Unicamp). [andremb@eco.unicamp.br](mailto:andremb@eco.unicamp.br); [pedrorossi@eco.unicamp.br](mailto:pedrorossi@eco.unicamp.br). This paper has been presented at the workshop "Development Strategies: Country Studies and International Comparisons" from November 12 to 14, 2013, in Shanghai within the context of the DAAD partnership on economic development studies, the East China Normal University (ECNU) and HTW Berlin – University of Applied Sciences organized.

<sup>1</sup> The discussion around social developmentalist is recent and much broader than the space given in this paper. In relation to this topic, we recommended reading Carneiro (2012), Biancarelli (2013), Bastos (2012) and Bielschowsky (2012), although the latter does not make use of that term.

In conceptual terms, very distinct development ideas, practices of economic policy or even "recipes" can be reunited under the label of "developmentalism". According to Fonseca (2004), developmentalism is the ideology that preaches government intervention, nationalism and industrialization for development. In this conceptual framework, developmentalism can assume various features such as those observed in the 1960s and 1970s, when the rapid economic growth that transformed the productive structures was accompanied by a deterioration in income distribution. This is certainly not the style of development best suited to Brazil's current needs and conditions.

Therefore, we must qualify the "developmentalism" that is defended here, as well as differentiating it from other proposals, practices or ideologies of the past and present. Starting from the recent Brazilian experience, this qualification specifically comprises incorporating and emphasizing the social dimension as a central and guiding development element. Resuming the argument, we understand that it is possible to be developmentalist only in economic terms. In other words, there are theoretical formulations and policy propositions, and there were several relevant historical experiences, in which the defense of the national interest, government intervention and search for a more sophisticated production structure were associated with a worsening in income distribution and/or other dimensions of the social differences that are characteristic of capitalism.

In Brazil in recent years, the economic and social dimensions have been reconciled, or reinforced, in a virtuous way. It is impossible to separate the growth cycle in the second half of the 2000s from the expansion of domestic demand, and the latter was greatly influenced by the accelerated personal income distribution process during this period. In practice, there has been an expansion of the mass consumer market as a dynamic engine of economic activity – a relationship that was already in the theoretical formulations of progressive economists for some decades and happened diametrically opposed to that seen in the 1960s/70s, when the concentration was functional to growth.

In addition to the favorable international framework, four major tools have been instrumental in this recent process, not all of which are duly recognized in the Brazilian public debate. The most famous of them were the policies of income transfer to poorer layers of the population – led by the “Bolsa Família” program – which have been heavily enhanced and expanded. In addition to these more focused actions, the other instruments of the Brazilian social security system that have a wide scope and very important impact, despite many problems, deserve to be highlighted.<sup>2</sup> The policy of the real appreciation of the minimum wage is the third element of this explanation and meant a direct expansion of purchasing power of a broader layer of society than those directly affected by the focused actions. Finally, and related to the last three, there is the favorable behavior of the labor market over the last decade, which is marked by major transformations still to be better explained, but has resulted in an intense process of formalization and a gradual reduction in the unemployment rates to historical low levels.<sup>3</sup> As additional impulse to the dynamism of the economy in recent years, the

---

2 According to data from the 2012 Social Security Analysis (ANFIP), the Benefits of Continuous Support (BPC) met 4 million elderly and disabled persons, with values around R\$ 30 billion in 2012.

3 Concerning the social protection system and its relations with the recent process of the Brazilian development, see the panoramic analysis of Castro (2012). In relation to the transformations underway in the Brazilian labor market, see Baltar (2013). In addition to the novelty in the Brazilian history, the virtuous relationship between growth and income distribution is a very rare feature in today's world (contrary to other times, mostly in Western Europe during the post-war period).

expansion of bank credit has positively influenced the disposable income of the population and played an important role in the expansion of the domestic market.

Looking forward, a developmentalism separated from the reduction of the huge social inequalities that mark the Brazilian society does not seem very suitable – or very promising in practical terms – in the current context. The social dimension must be at the center of the development strategy, and hence the name "social-developmentalism". However, this emphasis should not only serve to explain or praise the recent trajectory, much less to consider sufficient or secured the changes. On the contrary, the social character of the Brazilian development is justified more by the challenges (and, in the virtuous sense proposed here, opportunities) than by the progress achieved.

The concentration of income in Brazil remains among the highest in the world. Furthermore, the positive results in recent years have occurred in one of the dimensions of inequality: personal income concentration (and, not least, in the indices of misery and poverty). Indicators of inequality with other approaches (living conditions and consumption, with an emphasis on the access to sanitation; education; health) have shown more timid improvements in recent years, or have even increased in the differences.<sup>4</sup>

Another more important motivation to the social emphasis is the fact that the progress achieved so far was largely of a personal and private nature, strongly associated with the power of consumption. As commented, this had positive impacts on the economy, but little explored another venue of economic dynamism and reduction of inequality: the social infrastructure, or the commonly called collective or public goods, such as education, health, transportation and conditions of urban life, sanitation, etc. On the contrary, in several of these dimensions, there was a "private solution" for the social services that, if on the one hand expanded them and increased access, while on the other hand commodified social relations without ensuring their quality.

Therefore, the way forward is to go beyond the expansion of the mass consumer market, advancing in the social rights dimension (incidentally, provided for in the Constitution of 1988). Moreover, this is not only a goal in itself: the progress in this direction is also one of the motors for the future growth of the country. In addition to the effects already verified (and have not depleted) about income distribution on the consumer market, the expansion of social infrastructure also has great economic impact in sensitive areas. In the short-term, this means expansion of the investment. In the long-term, it influences the competitiveness of the productive sector by improving the educational, health and quality of life levels of the workforce.

In this way, next to the strengthening and efficiency gain of the government, as well as the reversal of troubling processes underway in the production structure, the renewal and deepening of social progress is one of the pillars of the "social-developmental" strategy held here.<sup>5</sup> In relation to this aspect, the macroeconomic policy considerations are detailed in the following sections.

## **2. Macroeconomic management in times of crisis**

---

4 A multisectoral approach to the issue of inequality is presented by Dedecca (2013).

5 For further details about these other pillars, as well as the ideas presented in this and the next section, see Biancarelli (2013).

Just as there is no recipe for development that applies to any country at any time, macroeconomic policy considerations also cannot be made abstractly without taking into account the economic context. In particular, the external context determines the market competition, the demand for exports, the availability of external financing, the expectations of agents, the determination of key macroeconomic prices, etc. In this sense, the external context shapes the options of the three political fronts (currency exchange, monetary and fiscal) and, moreover, conditions the Brazilian growth determinants.

Five years after the peak of the global financial crisis, the difficulties for the resumption of growth in the United States, which add up to much deeper problems (and much worse prospects) in Europe, as well as the almost structural state of the Japanese stagnation, means that the world lacks a dynamic engine. In this scenario, China has been trying to compensate for the reduction of its exporter dynamism to central economies with greater aggressiveness in the conquest of new markets (including the Brazilian and South American ones), while promoting a slow change in its model of growth, in pursuit of greater dependence on the domestic consumption to the detriment of net exports. For their part, several other economies try to grow through exports, which involves the use of monetary and exchange policies for the devaluation of national currencies and, to varying degrees, the use of trade protection instruments.

In this environment, it is natural that the international trade has a much smaller dynamism and that the multilateral efforts of trade liberalization face enormous difficulty in advancing. Furthermore, it is not surprising that commodity prices have less favorable behavior to the revenue of their exporters. As a more general implication to Brazil (in addition to the harshest conditions already reflected in the Trade Balance), it seems obvious that any growth attempt led by exports in this context would require far greater costs and sacrifices and would have a rather dubious effectiveness.

On the financial side, the overall framework is also distinct from the one existing during the pre-crisis, but its most important result – the ample global liquidity – has been restored amid high volatility. The most important determinant of this situation is the monetary overload given to the monetary policy in central countries as a tool for the recovery of activity. In addition to the basic interest rates at levels close to zero, a series of rather unorthodox monetary expansion policies are being implemented in the central economies.<sup>6</sup>

The effect that matters most to Brazil in this anomalous situation is the carry trade effect, involving leveraged investments in currencies with higher profitability. The speculative nature of such transactions linked to a scenario of uncertainty reinforces the distortion of exchange rates of the international system and increases their volatility. In the phase of high liquidity cycle, the currencies associated with a high interest rate are

---

6 Surely this framework – described synthetically by the expressions "currency war" and "monetary tsunami" – is not eternal, and its reversal already announced several times tends to decrease the inlet pressure of financial flows. However, based upon the weak signs of recovery so far, the long time needed for the digestion of the liabilities that are still present in banks and other financial institutions and the level in which the monetary stimuli are, a radical change in the international financial scenario – except in the event of a collapse of the Euro or the breaking of an important bank – does not seem likely for years to come. The signs of withdrawal of extraordinary monetary stimulus by the Federal Reserve, which became stronger at the end of the first half of 2013, have caused much volatility and speculation, particularly with the Brazilian exchange rate. Nonetheless, for the reasons mentioned above, and also because there are other important sources for the carry trade movements (notably in Europe and Japan), they do not seem sufficient to foresee a lasting reversal of the international liquidity cycle.

appreciated, while in times of financial instability, they are intense and abruptly depreciated. This pattern of monetary fluctuation should continue while interest rates remain at low levels in central economies. Despite signs of change in the US monetary policy, excess liquidity (and not its lack) and much volatility can be expected in the coming years.

Given this scenario, the most appropriate macroeconomic policy, and most consistent with the social character of developmentalism proposed here, is the pursuit of growth based on the domestic market. This requires the deepening and expansion of the social advances discussed earlier, the preservation of the current levels of employment and remuneration, as well as the expansion of public (in the priority areas also already mentioned) and private investment in the logistics infrastructure. The exchange rate should be handled with care, always seeking a level that is more favorable to the local production and prevents the leakage of impulses to the exterior. However, such an effort certainly involves considerations and policies that go far beyond macroeconomics.

Even if it were possible to transform an economy as the Brazilian one into an export-led growth only with macroeconomic policy and the cost of labor, the current conditions of international competition would require changes in these variables of such magnitude that the result would surely be a domestic recession. Moreover, what is worse, it is accompanied by the regression in several of the advances achieved by the country in recent years, which have contributed to its growth.

In short, the final message is that the external sector will hardly be the lever of the Brazilian growth. On the other hand, the external sector seems an insurmountable obstacle for the deepening of a well-articulated growth strategy. Without illusions of export-led in a world with predatory competition and vast idle capacity (in addition to the intensive use of spurious factors of competitiveness as very low wages), this requires the preservation and strengthening of what has been the key to the consolidation of the recent growth and what is one of the most scarce factor in today's world: internal demand.

### **3. Brazilian macroeconomic regime: a critical assessment**

The institutionality of the Brazilian macroeconomic regime currently in force dates back to 1999, when the tripod floating exchange rate, inflation targeting and primary fiscal target was set. The elaboration of this institutional architecture involved the assumption of a liberal conception about the role of the government. In this perspective, development is an emptied concept delivered to a commonly called natural character of the capitalist system, whose operation free from government interference would lead to an efficient resource allocation. Thus, the architecture of this regime sought to limit the government's discretion in the handling of macro policies. It was advocated that the macroeconomic instrument should be mobilized for the - almost exclusive - search of price stability, identified as a primordial condition for the development.

This restriction to the government role is at the root of the discussion concerning the macroeconomic regimes (LOPREATO, 2011). To the new classical theory, the macro regime must submit the government to an "inter-temporal restriction" so that it does not spoil the economic dynamics that works harmoniously under the reins of market. In a stylized manner, the goals of a macroeconomic regime in a neo-liberal project must focus on the exclusively price stability and solvency of the public sector in

the long run, preferably with reduced public spending over time, in order to reduce the size of the government and thus increase the efficiency in resources allocation.

For a social developmentalist project as envisaged here, the development is assumed as a political intention and not as spontaneity from the automatism of the market. In this way, the macroeconomic regime must be compatible with the government's active role in search for an economic dynamism capable of ensuring the deepening of the income distribution process and the expansion of social infrastructure. To do so, the government should enjoy a higher degree of discretion in the handling of macro policy, although this does not necessarily mean that rules and boundaries should not be established. These are essential so that the management is not restricted to the short-term horizon and can be reconciled with the long-term goals.

In the recent debate about the Brazilian growth model, the accuracy of the economic tripod was pointed out by several critics as being responsible for the low growth of the Brazilian economy and as a hindrance to its development. However, over time the macro regime has proved to be flexible and allowed changes in the form of management of policies, within the same institutional framework. Especially after the 2008 crisis, the foreign exchange policy now includes the capital controls among the instruments, the monetary policy now considers the supply side shocks for its decisions and the fiscal regime has incorporated, at least in terms of intentions, an anti-cyclical concern<sup>7</sup>. This prompts the question of whether this flexibility is enough to admit, among other things, a more active role of the government in the economy, the sustained growth and structural changes inherent to the process of economic development.

In the following subsections, we engage in critical discussion concerning the institutionality and management of the regime of macroeconomic policy in force in Brazil, characterized by the floating exchange rate, fiscal targets and inflation targeting.

### **3.1 Exchange rate policy and the need for greater control**

Despite the redundancy, it is worth mentioning that the main virtue of the floating exchange rate regime is its flexibility. In the face of an international context such as the current one, involving a high degree of uncertainty associated with the high volatility of financial variables and commodity prices, the exchange rate flexibility allows the absorption of external shocks that could otherwise have a strong impact on the domestic economy. For example, the abrupt changes in relative prices, when not quickly absorbed by the exchange rate, can generate inflationary pressures and thus overburden the monetary policy. Therefore, the institutionalization of an exchange regime with some reference rate (goals, foreign exchange bands, etc.) can generate important macroeconomic imbalances.<sup>8</sup>

If on the one hand some degree of flexibility is welcome, on the other hand an excessive flexibility can lead to distortions of various natures, as the exchange rate determined by the market is not necessarily best suited to the process of economic

---

7 This article does not aim to discuss whether or not the economic policy carried out from 2008 was correct, but rather to assess the possibilities of changes and ways of managing the macroeconomic regime.

8 Additionally, the definition of an exchange rate target implies an institutional commitment and allows failures in the conduct of the exchange rate policy. Faced with a large financial openness, the definition of an exchange rate target also exposes the regime to speculative attacks such as those that occurred in emerging countries in the 1990s, as described in Prates (2002).



development. For analytical purposes, we present in Chart 2 four reasons that justify an active exchange rate policy. These are divided into two groups, namely those linked to the Trade Account of the Balance of Payments and those linked to the Financial Account.

**Chart 2: Four reasons for the exchange policy**

Exchange rate policy	Reasons	Trade Account	Financial Account
Administration of the volatility		<b>1. Cycle of commodity prices</b>	<b>4. Excesses from the financial market</b>
Administration of the level		<b>2. Dutch Disease</b>	<b>4. Carry trade.</b>

The first reason for an active exchange rate policy is the cycle of commodity prices. Considering the Hicks system (1974), which differentiates the markets between fix-price and flex-price, given the nature of the production process (product cycle, idle capacity, etc.), the sectors that produce industrial goods tend to adjust the quantities produced given the demand shocks, while those that produce commodities tend to adjust prices. Thus, the export revenue of the country producer of commodity tends to be more volatile than that of a country exporter of industrial goods and, therefore, the supply of foreign currencies arising from external trade will depend on the price cycle of basic products. This instability is transmitted to the exchange rate, which affects the rest of the economy. Thus, in countries with an export agenda heavily based on commodities, the foreign exchange policy is important to lessen the impact of this price fluctuation in the exchange rate.

The existence of a high competitive commodities exporter sector leads to the second argument linked to Current Account, which justifies the use of an active exchange policy. As explored by Bresser-Pereira (2008), the role of this sector in a national economy is subjected to the risks of the commonly termed "Dutch disease", which is manifested as a chronic tendency to currency appreciation. One of the relevant points of approach is the identification of an equilibrium exchange rate for the Current Account, whose level is more appreciated than that required for the development of a competitive industrial sector.<sup>9</sup> In this case, the role of the foreign exchange policy is to prevent an excessive appreciation of the exchange rate and a specialization of the domestic economy in the production of primary goods. Even if the concept of "equilibrium rate" and the "chronic" character of the appreciation tendency are questionable, they are an important thought for economies such as the Brazilian one.

Specific exchange policies can be designed to meet these distortions, such as taxes on the exports of commodities, which are causes of Dutch disease, or the constitution of stabilization funds, such as those established by oil exporting economies (United Arab Emirates, Kuwait, Iran, Norway, Russia, Venezuela) or other commodities, such as Chile (CAGNIN *et al.*, 2008).

9 "The Dutch disease or the curse of natural resources can be defined as the chronicle overvaluation of the exchange rate of a country caused by Ricardian rents that the country gets when exploiting abundant and cheap resources, whose commercial production compatible with an exchange rate of current balance is clearly more appreciated than the industrial equilibrium exchange rate." (BRESSER-PEREIRA & GALA: 2010: 671)

The third reason for the exchange rate policy is the need to neutralize the temporary or cyclical distortions caused by the financial sector. This is because the financial market does not necessarily lead the exchange rate to an alleged equilibrium and therefore the exchange rate policy has the role of containing the excesses, avoiding overshootings and exaggerated volatility. This volatility is particularly harmful to countries such as Brazil, with high pass-through between the exchange rate and inflation. For this purpose, it is appropriate to use capital controls on short-term financial flows that are inherently volatile, as well as regulatory measures on the foreign exchange derivatives market.

However, in the Brazilian case, the financial distortions go beyond volatility and cause long processes of exchange rate appreciation interspersed with short and sharp depreciation periods, such as that experienced in June 2013. This pattern of behavior of the exchange rate is pronounced in the Brazilian economy due to the high profitability of financial investments and mainly the high interest rates practiced in the country. Carry trade operations were a constant pressure on the Brazilian currency appreciation in the recent period (ROSSI, 2012). This operation is one of the main transmission mechanisms of international liquidity cycle to exchange rates and consists of an inter-currency investment involving the formation of a liability (or a short position) in the currency of low interest rates and an asset (or a long position) in the currency of higher interest rates.<sup>10</sup>

In a pendulum motion, carry trade operations tend to appreciate currencies with high interest rates during the ascending phase of the liquidity cycle and undervalue them in the reversal phase. The important detail is that this movement tends to happen asymmetrically: the process of optimism that characterizes the international liquidity expansion occurs more gradually, while the mood reversals are usually more abrupt. As shown by McCauley and McGuire (2009), as well as Kohler (2010), the most depreciated currencies during the more acute period of the 2008 financial crisis were those that were the target of carry trade, while the funding currencies served as a safe haven of financial flows and consequently appreciated during the crisis.<sup>11</sup>

In those terms, the reasons related to the Financial Account justify adopting foreign exchange policies to avoid excessive volatility in the exchange rate, as well as an excessive appreciation of the domestic currency. In this context, the architecture of exchange rate policy must be assembled to neutralize financial distortions, given that the subjection of the national currency to the speculative cycles from the financial sector is incompatible with long-term economic development.

After the 2008 international crisis, Brazil has advanced in the direction of a more active exchange policy. The accumulation of foreign exchange reserves was complemented with measures of control of financial flows (taxes on investments in equities, fixed income and loans), market regulation measures of interbank exchange (encumbrance of excessive short positions of banks in the cash market) and the foreign exchange derivatives market (tax on short positions in dollar). These measures that have been implemented and partly withdrawn between 2008 and 2013 proved to be efficient

---

10"It is therefore a leveraged investment that implies currency mismatch. The generalization of this type of operation gives specific features to the dynamics of exchange rates. It follows that, the way that the financial wealth allocation is promoted by the carry trade is not restricted to an allocation process of financial asset, but also to the formation of liabilities." (ROSSI, 2012: 26)

11It is interesting to note that, at the peak of the flight-to-liquidity of the 2008 crisis, the Japanese currency was the only one that appreciated against the US dollar. According to McCauley and McGuire (2009) and Kohler (2010), the explanation for this lies in its role as the carry trade funding currency.

for both the qualitative improvement of capital flows and a lower volatility of the exchange rate.

However, despite the expansion of foreign exchange policy instruments, some structural aspects have not been modified. In particular, the Brazilian exchange market permeability to financial speculation is a critical element that needs to be addressed. The speculative nature of the Brazilian exchange market is mainly due to the interest rate differential of the Brazilian currency in relation to the others, as well as the liquidity asymmetry existing between the market of derivatives and the foreign exchange cash market, as discussed in Rossi (2012). Therefore, for an exchange rate that is less subject to financial distortion, a reform in the Brazilian exchange market is necessary to increase liquidity in the cash market and reduce the activities of speculators, whose work primarily focuses on the future market.

### **3.2 Fiscal policy, anti-cyclical action and the search for room for investment**

An important task of the macroeconomic regime is to avoid sharp movements in the pace of activity, called the anti-cyclical role. This action must be guided by the goal of sustaining economic growth, and particularly the rate of investment, to enable the advancement of structural changes inherent to the development project. To this end, the guidance of public spending is strategic because it is an autonomous source of aggregate demand. In addition, all the emphasis on the social infrastructure and public services defended here as a guide for a "social-developmentalism" require significant fiscal resources for their implementation.

According to these criteria, the conduct of the fiscal policy as presented in Brazil – guided by annual fiscal targets – can and should be improved. This is because within this regime, not only is the fiscal result pro-cyclical, but also the search for the fulfillment of the goal throughout the year reinforces this pro-cyclical character. There is therefore an inadequacy in the establishment of annual targets that have the purpose of long-term debt sustainability, but disregards the economic cycle and the endogenous relationship between public spending and growth.

By definition, the government has control over its decision to spend, although its revenue depends on income generation, or economic growth. Thus, the establishment of an annual goal implies that, the government undertakes a fiscal result at the beginning of the year based on an expectation of revenues, considering the estimated economic growth. However, the growth might not perform as planned during the year, resulting in a smaller tax revenue than expected, thus undermining the fiscal result.<sup>12</sup> Given this, the government can: a) announce that it will not fulfill the goal and be accountable to society' b) announce nothing and fulfill the accounting of the primary goal through rebates and the anticipation of dividends; or c) take additional measures to raise taxes or reduce spending to ensure the fiscal goal of the period.

Of these three options, the first two are bad for the government's credibility and the latter is more adjusted to the prevailing tax regime. However, it is the worst among them, given that the search to fulfill the goal through an emergency and contractionary fiscal policy removes stimuli to the aggregate demand of an already sluggish economy and further reduces the economic growth. Added to this, the most common output for this type of adjustment is the curtailment or postponement of investment projects, as a

---

<sup>12</sup> One way to measure the impact of the cycle in the primary result is by estimating the structural primary result. Concerning this measure, see Gobetti *et al.* (2010).

large part of public expenditure is bound and thus tax increases or expenditure cutting are not always politically feasible. In other words, the search for fiscal goal adds an anti-investment bias to this tax regime in the short-term.

Similarly, the annual target for the primary surplus is inappropriate when economic growth is greater than that projected by the government. In this case, there is an incentive for the excess revenues to be materialized in the expansion of the public spending. By influencing the already heated economy, this additional spending can generate an excess aggregate demand and place pressure on the price level. Thus, the conduct of fiscal policy does not cooperate with the regime of inflation targeting, given that it potentially increases demand inflation and imposes the need for a contractionary monetary policy to control prices.

In summary, in the regime of annual fiscal targets, not only is the fiscal result pro-cyclical, but also the search to fulfill the fiscal goal throughout the year reinforces this pro-cyclical character and accentuates the economic cycle. As addressed here, surplus goals are established for annual periods through a model that estimates the long-term debt sustainability. The criticism that arises is the inadequacy of establishing annual goals in the long-term model, disregarding the economic cycle and the endogenous relationship between public spending and growth.

However, there are two ways to neutralize this problem and reconcile the targeting regime with the anti-cyclical management of the fiscal policy. The first one refers to the lengthening of the periodicity of the target to encompass the economic cycle. A medium-term goal would give more flexibility to the fiscal policy to have expansionary and contractionary moments, ensuring the expected surplus on average for the period. The drawback of this proposal is that it assumes a conjecture about the nature of the economic cycle and its periodicity, which does not always follow a pre-determined pattern.

The second proposition is to establish an institutional mechanism with clear rules, allowing the public spending to be expansionary in times of low growth and contractionary in times of high growth, thus preserving the continuity of a surplus goal with annual periodicity. This might be feasible through a budgetary fund with public resources reserves, which, when used, must have the specific purpose of public investment. Thus, there would be a legal apparatus that allows the expansion of public investment in the low economic cycle and obliges the government to save the excess revenues in the high economic cycle<sup>13</sup>.

An anti-cyclical policy that guarantees the sustainability of the growth process also opens up fiscal space to expand public investment, as already pointed out as an economic expansion engine and one of the main axes of the development strategy defended here. Larger investments in social infrastructure would have important multiplier effects in terms of employment, income and boosting local economies. Moreover, as the coverage and quality of public services (of education, health, transport, etc.) are expanded, the increasing portion of family income committed to these expenses would be released for other uses. This second effect is greater for poorer layers of the population. The expansion of disposable income seems to be an instrument of income distribution that is more powerful (and fair) than the extension of subsidies to the

---

13 It is worth noting that for a more efficient use of the anti-cyclical fiscal policy, the recovery of the Brazilian government's capacity to plan and execute public investment is necessary.

private providers of social services, often of poor quality, of these social rights, which only reinforces the need for a new public pro-investment fiscal policy.

### **3.3 Inflation targeting and the flexibility needed**

The regime of inflation targeting has the advantage of establishing a public commitment to price stability and a reference framework for the monetary policy. This regime is flexible when compared with the alternatives of monetary targeting regime and nominal anchor exchange rate policies,<sup>14</sup> and comprises different forms of institutionalization of the regime and its management. The analysis of the Brazilian case points to a need for greater flexibility of the inflation targeting system, given the structural transformation processes of the economy.

According to the recipe of the commonly called "new macroeconomic consensus", the management of the targets system must rely on using the interest rate instrument with the aim of affecting aggregate demand. However, the causes of inflation are not restricted to a problem of demand; moreover, there are structural issues associated with the development process that are sources of price increase on the supply side.

For example, the process of reducing income inequality can cause a configuration drift between wage growth and productivity. In a first moment, real wage increase generates an increase pressure in production costs. In a second moment, the re-composition of the profit margin of entrepreneurs generates a new round of price increase, which in turn reduces real wages.<sup>15</sup> Additionally, the process of income redistribution also results in changes on the demand side, given that the entry of new consumer classes widens the market and requires adjustments in the supply conditions, which can take time.<sup>16</sup>

Another cost pressure resulting from the development process is the emergence of bottlenecks such as infrastructure, transport, logistics, energy, etc. Investments in infrastructure represent one of the expansion fronts of the development, which, besides being the engine of growth and a development axis, are absolutely necessary in order that this process does not bump into inflation derived from an increase in production costs. Thus, fiscal policy measures that expand or encourage investment in strategic sectors also play an important role in the price control policy.

The fluctuation of commodity prices is another important source of cost inflation. In the recent past, the exchange rate has been an important channel of monetary policy transmission and the absorption of supply shocks from commodity prices. However, the use of the exchange rate for this purpose is extremely problematic due to the volatility pattern of commodity prices. Insofar as the exchange rate reproduces this volatility pattern, the industrial exports and productive investment are undermined.

---

14 Evidently, it is less flexible than a purely discretionary monetary regime.

15 In turn, the transfer of the high production costs to prices depends on the structure of the productive sectors. "It is reasonable to consider that, in general, oligopolistic sectors (with greater market power) tend to be more inflationary for at least two possible reasons: i) they have greater ability to pass along cost increases in prices; and ii) they can be relatively immune to the contractionary effects of the monetary policy, as they do not necessarily compete via price." (MODENESI *et al.*, 2012: 205)

16 This process is associated with the expanding of the internal market of mass consumption proposed by Bielschowsky (2012) and already commented in section I.

As an alternative instrument, we can highlight the management of import and export tariffs as an aid to the regime of inflation targeting. In the case of predominantly imported products such as wheat, the reduction of import tariffs can be used in times of this product's increasing price in the international market. In the case of an increase in the price of Brazilian export tariff products that have a major impact on the inflation index, export tax represents an alternative. This increase will prompt the redirection of the production for export to the internal market, thus boosting supply and lowering prices.

In the case of commodities and the other cases in which inflation stems from supply problems, the effectiveness of using the interest rate as an instrument of monetary policy is extremely limited. The increase in interest rates tends to inhibit investment and retract the offer, thus reinforcing the causes of inflation.<sup>17</sup> Accordingly, the monetary contraction might affect the aggregate demand, thereby reducing the growth without affecting the original cause of inflation.<sup>18</sup> Thus, instruments that are alternative and auxiliary to the monetary policy under the inflation targeting regime should be considered.

In short, the regime of inflation targeting might be appropriate for the developmentalism project defended here, given that it is flexible. However, its management must consider three important points: 1) that inflation targeting is not an exclusive goal of the monetary policy; 2) that inflation targeting is flexible enough to accommodate price pressures arising from structural changes inherent to the development process and other supply shocks; and 3) that the interest rate is not the only instrument to achieve the goal of inflation and that other instruments are used depending on the origin of the phenomenon and the nature of the inflationary impulse.

In addition to these issues, the regime of inflation targeting should be compatible with the Brazilian economy's transition to a pattern of lower interest rates. This transition is absolutely necessary to create a macroeconomic environment that is more suited to productive investment and enables the development of a credit system of long-term financing and the improved competitiveness of the productive sector. This transition will be responsible for profound structural changes in the economy, since the fall of the basic interest rate must be accompanied by the fall of the other profitability rates of the system.

The management of the regime of inflation targeting in Brazil has shown some progress in recent years. In particular, we highlight the concern about economic growth that was manifested in recurrent speeches of the monetary authorities, as well as the use of macro-prudential policies as an alternative instrument to the interest rate in terms of controlling inflation. The Central Bank's significant reduction in the levels of the SELIC rate (short-term interest rate) over the course of 2011 and 2012 was an explicit demonstration of intent to reduce this anomaly of the Brazilian economy, taking advantage of the favorable conjunctures and even facing the powerful resistance against the reduction in the cost of money in Brazil. However, this key price has subsequently increased since April 2013, in a movement that actually responds to a rise in inflation, but which should not mean a return to the levels – and the rigidity of the objectives and instruments – verified on the economic policy until 2011.

---

17 In addition, nominal interest should be considered as a cost component for businesses, as both a financial cost for indebted companies and an opportunity cost of capital for all firms (SERRANO, 2010).

18 Depending on the combination of factors, the interest increase might even lead to a rise in inflation, since it reduces the supply ability.

#### **4. Final remarks**

In the light of the recent Brazilian experience and its future possibilities, this paper has sought to reflect upon the relations between two dimensions of economic reality and the economic policies that are usually analyzed separately: macroeconomic management and the development strategy. The final message is that, despite the necessary separations between these two perspectives, they need to be tuned. Especially when it is believed that the task of development cannot be undertaken solely by market forces

In more accurate terms, we need the exchange rate, fiscal and monetary policies, which alone are not a sufficient condition for development, to create minimum conditions (and the least possible constraints) for the longer-term objectives of the country, namely defending the national interest and space, a relevant role for government action, the sophistication of the production structure and, in the point highlighted here, the reduction of social inequalities that have historically characterized Brazil.

This last aspect, which justifies the "social-developmental" label, must mean an advance in relation to the undeniable achievements of the last decade, mostly in the form of the expansion and improvement in the supply of public goods. Investment in social infrastructure and the living conditions of the population, especially in urban centers, is a necessary and urgent complement to the improvements in personal income distribution, which should continue, given that the path is long until acceptable levels are attained. To justify such choices, we not only have the political and moral imperatives, but also the positive economic impacts that the social improvements have caused and continue to cause in the country, especially in front of a number of external constraints that show the domestic market as a large (and perhaps the only) source of dynamism.

The macroeconomic regime is a necessary condition to account for this renewal and deepening of the social character of the Brazilian development. It must therefore be part of the strategic planning and reinforce the articulation with other development policies such as social, industrial, technological, public investment, infrastructure, wage and other policies.

The analysis of the floating exchange, annual primary fiscal target and inflation targeting regimes shows that the theoretical assumptions that give substrate to them do not converge with the social-developmental project. This macroeconomic regime was originally designed to impose limits on the discretion of the government's action and to submit the political authorities to the principles of a liberal vision of development, within which the market is the main protagonist. However, a direct correspondence cannot be established between these theoretical principles and the operationalization of the macro regime, which has been shown to be flexible.

In this sense, we assessed that the current macroeconomic institutional framework can be flexible enough to accommodate a development project in which the government has an inducer role and the social is the central focus of its activities. As pointed out, it is clear that we must move forward in this direction to increase the control over the functioning of the foreign exchange market, turn the fiscal policy effectively into anti-cyclical and with more room for public investment, as well as

ensuring that the flexibility allowed by inflation targeting translates into sustainable reductions in interest rates in the country.

Nonetheless, this analysis is ultimately optimistic about the compatibility between the two dimensions addressed. Perhaps better phrased, it does not consider that the debate concerning the possible abandonment (or not) of the so-called macroeconomic "tripod" should be the focus when the goal is to deepen and renew the virtuous traits of a development style that has made advances in recent years. Considering some enhancements and more appropriate management, the institutionality of the floating exchange, primary fiscal target and inflation targeting regimes can accommodate the social-developmental project.

### **References:**

- BALTAR, P. (2013). Crescimento da Economia e Mercado de Trabalho no Brasil. IPEA/IE-Unicamp, *mimeo*.
- BASTOS, P. P. (2012) A economia política do novo-desenvolvimentismo e do social desenvolvimentismo, *Economia e Sociedade*, Campinas, v.21, Nº Especial, dez 2012.
- BIANCARELLI, A. (2013). Por Uma Agenda Social-Desenvolvimentista para o Brasil. *FPA Discute: Desenvolvimento*. São Paulo: Fundação Perseu Abramo. Disponível em <http://novo.fpabramo.org.br/sites/default/files/fpa-discute-desenvolvimento-v2-1.pdf>.
- BIELSCHOWSKY, R. (2012). Estratégia de desenvolvimento e as três frentes de expansão no Brasil: um desenho conceitual. *Economia e Sociedade* v. 21, n. Especial, pp. 729-747.
- BRESSER-PEREIRA, L. C. (2008) The Dutch Disease and its Neutralization: a Ricardian Approach. *Revista de Economia Política*. Vol. 28, nº. 1 (109), pp. 47-71, Jan./Mar. 2008.
- BRESSER-PEREIRA, L. C.; GALA, P. (2010) Macroeconomia estruturalista do desenvolvimento, *Revista de Economia Política*, v. 30, N. 4: 663-686.
- CAGNIN, R, CINTRA, M. FARHI, M. & ALMEIDA, J. (2008) O debate em torno dos fundos cambiais: experiências internacionais, Texto para Discussão, IE/UNICAMP, n. 150, nov. 2008.
- CARNEIRO, R. (2012) Velhos e novos desenvolvimentismos, *Economia e Sociedade*, Campinas, v.21, Número Especial, dez 2012.
- CASTRO, J. A. (2012). Política social e desenvolvimento no Brasil. *Economia e Sociedade* v. 21, n. Especial, pp. 1011-1042.
- DEDECCA, C. (2013). A redução da desigualdade e seus desafios. IPEA/IE-Unicamp, *mimeo*.
- FONSECA, P. (2004) Gênese e percursos do desenvolvimentismo no Brasil, *Revista pesquisa e debate*, São Paulo, PUCSP, 15(2): 225-56.
- GOBETTI, S. W. *et al.* (2010) Resultado Fiscal Estrutural: um passo para a institucionalização de políticas anticíclicas no Brasil, *Texto pra discussão do IPEA*, 1515.



- HICKS, J. (1974) *The Crisis in Keynesian Economics*. New York: Basic Books.
- KOHLER, M. (2010) Exchange rates during financial crises, *BIS Quarterly Review*, March 2010.
- LOPREATO, F. (2011) *Caminhos da política fiscal do Brasil*, Tese de Livre Docência, IE- Unicamp, Campinas, 2011.
- McCAULEY, R. N. & MCCGUIRE, P. (2009) Dollar appreciation in 2008: safe haven, carry trades, dollar shortage and overhedging, *BIS Quarterly Review*, pp. 85-93, December 2009.
- PRATES, D. M. (2002) Crises financeiras dos países “emergentes”: uma interpretação heterodoxa, Campinas: IE/UNICAMP, *Tese de Doutorado*.
- ROSSI, P. (2012) Taxa de câmbio no Brasil: dinâmicas da arbitragem e da especulação, *Tese de Doutorado*, Campinas, IE-UNICAMP.
- SERRANO, F. (2010) O conflito distributivo e a teoria da inflação inercial, *Revista de Economia Contemporânea*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 14, n. 2, p. 395-421, maio/ago.